



**Oversight and Governance**

Chief Executive's Department  
Plymouth City Council  
Ballard House  
Plymouth PL1 3BJ

Please ask for Ross Jago

T 01752 305155

E Head of Governance, Performance and Risk  
[democraticsupport@plymouth.gov.uk](mailto:democraticsupport@plymouth.gov.uk)

[www.plymouth.gov.uk](http://www.plymouth.gov.uk)

Published 18 November 2022

## CITY COUNCIL - SUPPLEMENT PACK TWO

Monday 21 November 2022

2.00 pm

Council House, Plymouth

**Members:**

Lord Mayor, Chair

Deputy Lord Mayor, Vice Chair

Councillors Allen, Mrs Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Mrs Bowyer, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Burden, Carlyle, Churchill, Coker, Collins, Cree, Cresswell, Darcy, Deacon, Drean, Evans OBE, Finn, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Kelly, Laing, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugg, Dr Mahony, McDonald, Murphy, Nicholson, Partridge, Patel, Mrs Pengelly, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Riley, Salmon, Shayer, Singh, Smith, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wakeham, Ms Watkin and Wheeler.

Members are invited to attend the above meeting to consider the items of business overleaf.

For further information on attending Council meetings and how to engage in the democratic process please follow this link - [Get Involved](#)

**Tracey Lee**

Chief Executive

## **City Council**

### **4. Political Proportionality and Appointments to Committees: (Pages 1 - 16)**

# COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS AND PROPORTIONALITY NOVEMBER (V2) 2022



## I. LEGISLATIVE REQUIREMENTS OF PROPORTIONALITY

- I.1. Section 15 (5) of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989 imposes a duty on Councils to review the representation of different political groups on bodies to which the Council makes appointments. The Act requires that the review should be held at the Annual General Meeting or as soon as practicable after that meeting or when the membership of the Council changes.
- I.2. The Act provides four principles concerning political representation that must be observed when conducting a review. These are:
  - a) that not all the seats on committees are allocated to the same political group;
  - b) that the majority of the seats on each committee are allocated to a particular political group if the number of persons belonging to that group are a majority of the authority's membership;
  - c) subject to (a) and (b), that the number of seats on committees which are allocated to each group bears the same proportion to the total of all the seats on committees of the council as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority, and
  - d) Subject to (a) to (c) above, that the number of seats on each committee which are allocated to each political group bears the same proportion to the number of all the seats on that committee as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority.
- I.3. The legislation provides that the Council may make alternative arrangements to the 'proportionality' principles only by a unanimous vote, with no member voting against.
- I.4. The Committees and Panels to which the provisions of Section 15 of the Act apply, and the recommended allocation of seats on each, applying the principles of the Act as closely as is reasonably practicable, are shown in Section 2 below. The recommended allocation of seats reflects the four proportionality principles so far as reasonably practicable.

## 2. OVERALL PROPORTIONALITY 2022/2023 (November) - NUMBER OF SEATS ON COUNCIL

Group	November 2022
Conservative	27 (47.3%)
Labour	24 (42.1%)
Green	2 (3.51%)
Independent Alliance	3 (5.25%)
Independent Member	1 (1.75%)

\* There are 57 members on Plymouth City Council. The Local Government and Housing Act 1989, which sets out how seats should be allocated to members on a Council, describes the distribution of seats between the political Groups into which the Council has divided itself. There is no seat entitlement to members who are not in a Group. The definition of what constitutes a group on a

Council is covered in The Local Government (Committees and Political Groups) Regulations 1990 and can be found in the following link <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukSI/1990/1553/part/III/made>

A single representative does not constitute a Group which is defined as a number of persons bound together by common interests. As such, a single Member is not entitled to any Committee seats. This is consistent with practice previously employed by the Council in similar circumstances.

## 2.1. The application of the legislative principles is set out below:

Local Government Act 1989 – Principles	Is this principle met?
a. that not all the seats on committees are allocated to the same political group	<b>Principle Met</b>
b. that the majority of the seats on each committee are allocated to a particular political group if the number of persons belonging to that group are a majority of the authority's membership;	<b>Not applicable as there is no majority group.</b>
c. subject to (a) and (b), that the number of seats on committees which are allocated to each group bears the same proportion to the total of all the seats on committees of the council as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority;	<b>Principle met</b>
d. Subject to (a) to (c) above, that the number of seats on each committee which are allocated to each political group bears the same proportion to the number of all the seats on that committee as is borne by the number of members of that group to the membership of the authority.	<b>Principle met - As far as reasonably practicable.</b>

<b>Conservative 28 / Labour 24 / Green 2 / Independent Alliance 3</b> <u>Non-aligned Independents are excluded from seat allocation</u> Greens are entitled to five seats on committees - suggestion for how that is distributed in this table. There remains 14 seats to be allocated.									<b>Total Seats</b>	<b>Allocated Seats</b>	<b>Vacant Seats</b>
<b>Councillors</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>47.37%</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>42.11%</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3.51%</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>5.26%</b>			
<b>Seat Allocation as % membership</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>63.00</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>56.00</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>4.67</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7.00</b>			
<b>Planning Committee</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6.16</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5.47</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.46</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.68</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Taxi Licensing Committee</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3.32</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.95</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.37</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Licensing Committee</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6.16</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5.47</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.46</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.68</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Chief Officer Appointments Panel</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3.32</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.95</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.37</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Chief Officer Disciplinary Panel</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3.32</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.95</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.37</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Chief Officer Appeals Panel</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3.32</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>2.95</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.37</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Audit and Governance Committee</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.37</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2.11</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.18</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.26</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry JC</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2.37</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2.11</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.18</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.26</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Devon and Somerset Fire Authority</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1.89</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1.68</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.14</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.21</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Growth and Infrastructure Scrutiny</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6.16</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5.47</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.46</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.68</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Performance Scrutiny</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6.16</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5.47</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.46</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.68</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Children's Scrutiny</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6.16</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5.47</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.46</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.68</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Health &amp; Adult Care Scrutiny</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6.16</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5.47</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.46</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0.68</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Standards Advisory Board</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.84</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.53</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.21</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.32</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Lord Mayors Selection Committee</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3.32</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.95</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.37</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Seats allocated</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>133</b>	<b>133</b>	<b>0</b>

## Regulatory Committees

<b>Planning Committee</b>	
<b>13 councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Six Conservative Councillors, Five Labour Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Alliance Councillor.</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Ian Darcy</a>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Kathy Watkin</a>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Philip Partridge</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Patrick Nicholson</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">James Stoneman</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Rebecca Smith</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Sarah Allen</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Zoe Reilly</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Bill Stevens</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Ian Tuffin</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Tina Tuohy</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Ian Poyser</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Nick Kelly</a>	
<b>Substitutes</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Vivien Pengelly</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Andrea Loveridge</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Lee Finn</a>	
Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed planning training	

<b>Taxi Licensing Committee</b>	
<b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Four Conservative Councillors, Three Labour Councillor</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Nigel Churchill</a>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Chip Tofan</a>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Phil Partridge</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Sally Haydon</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Eddie Rennie</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Ian Tuffin</a>	
<b><a href="#">Conservative Vacancy</a></b>	
Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed training	
<b>Substitutes</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Andy Lugger</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Dan Collins</a>	

<b>Licensing Committee</b>	
<b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Six Conservative Councillors, Six Labour Councillors, One Independent Alliance Councillor</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Phil Partridge</a>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">David Salmon</a>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Nigel Churchill</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Stephen Hulme</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">James Stoneman</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Vivien Pengelly</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Sarah Allen</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Dr Charlotte Cree</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Ian Tuffin</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Sue McDonald</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Eddie Rennie</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Dylan Tippetts</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Chaz Singh</a>	
Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed planning training	
<b>Substitutes</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Pat Patel</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Dr John Mahony</a>	



<b>Audit and Governance Committee</b>	
<b>Five councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Three Conservative Councillors, two Labour Councillors</b>	
Councillor <b>Andy Lugger</b>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Mark Lowry</b>	<b>Vice Chair (Labour)</b>
Councillor <b>Chip Tofan</b>	
Councillor <b>Tudor Evans OBE</b>	
<b>Conservative Vacancy</b>	
Any councillor may act as a substitute member if they have undergone the Council's prescribed training	
<b>Substitutes</b>	
Councillor <b>Philip Partridge</b>	
Councillor <b>Lee Finn</b>	
Councillor <b>Jemima Laing</b>	

## Scrutiny Committees

<b>Performance, Finance and Customer Focus Overview and Scrutiny Committee</b>	
<b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Six Conservative Councillors, Five Labour Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Alliance Councillor.</b>	
Councillor <b>Chris Penberthy</b>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Lee Finn</b>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Dan Collins</b>	
Councillor <b>Stephen Hulme</b>	
Councillor <b>Chip Tofan</b>	
Councillor <b>Nigel Churchill</b>	
Councillor <b>Phillip Partridge</b>	
Councillor <b>Sally Haydon</b>	
Councillor <b>Mark Lowry</b>	
Councillor <b>Bill Stevens</b>	
Councillor <b>Brian Vincent</b>	
Councillor <b>George Wheeler</b>	
Councillor <b>Independent Alliance</b>	
With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member	

<b>Health and Adult Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee</b>	
<b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Six Conservative Councillors, Five Labour Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Alliance Councillor.</b>	
Councillor <b>Mary Aspinall</b>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Mark Deacon</b>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Natalie Harrison</b>	
Councillor <b>Phillip Partridge</b>	
Councillor <b>Patrick Nicholson</b>	
Councillor <b>Vivien Pengelly</b>	
Councillor <b>Lee Finn</b>	
Councillor <b>Pauline Murphy</b>	
Councillor <b>Zoe Reilly</b>	
Councillor <b>Ian Tuffin</b>	
Councillor <b>Sue McDonald</b>	
Councillor <b>George Wheeler</b>	
Councillor <b>Independent Alliance</b>	
With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member	

<b>Education and Children's Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee</b>	
<b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Six Conservative Councillors, Five Labour Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Alliance Councillor.</b>	
Councillor <b>Jemima Laing</b>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Vivien Pengelly</b>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Andrea Loveridge</b>	
Councillor <b>Mark Deacon</b>	
Councillor <b>Phillip Partridge</b>	
Councillor <b>Chip Tofan</b>	
Councillor <b>Natalie Harrison</b>	
Councillor <b>Sarah Allen</b>	
Councillor <b>Tom Briars-Delve</b>	
Councillor <b>Sally Cresswell</b>	
Councillor <b>Dr Charlotte Cree</b>	
Councillor <b>Ian Poyser</b>	
Councillor <b>Mrs Terri Beer</b>	
With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member	

<b>Growth and Infrastructure Overview and Scrutiny Committee</b>	
<b>Thirteen councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Six Conservative Councillors, Five Labour Councillors, One Green Councillor, One Independent Alliance Councillor.</b>	
Councillor <b>John Riley</b>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <b>Mark Coker</b>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <b>David Salmon</b>	
Councillor <b>Chip Tofan</b>	
Councillor <b>Lee Finn</b>	
Councillor <b>Andy Lugg</b>	
Councillor <b>Phillip Partridge</b>	
Councillor <b>Neil Hendy</b>	
Councillor <b>Jeremy Goslin</b>	
Councillor <b>Charlotte Holloway</b>	
Councillor <b>Dylan Tippetts</b>	
Councillor <b>Ian Poyser</b>	
Councillor <b>Independent Alliance</b>	
With the exception of Cabinet Members, any councillor may act as a substitute member	

## Chief Officer Panels

<b>Chief Officer Appointments Panel</b>	
<b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Four Conservative Councillors, Three Labour Councillors</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Richard Bingley</a>	<b>Chair</b>
	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Vivien Pengelly</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Andy Lugger</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Mary Aspinall</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Tudor Evans OBE</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Jemima Laing</a>	
<b>Conservative Vacancy</b>	
Cabinet Members must not be in the majority on the panel	
Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed personnel training	
Councillor <a href="#">Jonathan Drean</a>	
<b>Chief Officer Disciplinary Panel</b>	
<b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Four Conservative Councillors, Three Labour Councillors</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Richard Bingley</a>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Bill Wakeham</a>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">John Riley</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Sally Haydon</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Mark Lowry</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Eddie Rennie</a>	
Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed personnel training	
<b>Chief Officer Appeals Panel</b>	
<b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Three Conservative Councillors, Three Labour Councillors</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Dan Collins</a>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Vivien Pengelly</a>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Patrick Nicholson</a>	

Councillor <b>Chris Penberthy</b>
Councillor <b>Pauline Murphy</b>
Councillor <b>Ian Tuffin</b>
<b>Labour Vacancy</b>
Any councillor may act as a substitute member provided that they have undergone the Council's prescribed personnel training.

## Joint Committees / Authorities

<b>Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee</b>	
<b>Five councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Two Conservative Councillors, two Labour Councillors, one Independent Alliance Councillor</b>	
Councillor Jonathan Drean	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor Pat Patel	
Councillor Neil Hendy	
Councillor Mark Coker	
Councillor Chaz Singh	

<b>Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Authority</b>	
<b>Four councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Two Conservative Councillors, two Labour Councillors</b>	
Councillor Mark Shayer	
Councillor Jonathan Drean	
Councillor Mary Aspinall	
Councillor Neil Hendy	



## Other Committees

<b>Lord Mayor Selection Committee</b>	
<b>Seven councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Four Conservative Councillors, Three Labour Councillors</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">Richard Bingley</a>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Mark Shayer</a>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Rebecca Smith</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Mary Aspinall</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Tudor Evans OBE</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Pauline Murphy</a>	
<b><a href="#">Conservative Vacancy</a></b>	

<b>Standards Advisory Group</b>	
<b>Six councillors (proportional)</b>	
<b>Three Conservative Councillors, three Labour Councillors</b>	
Councillor <a href="#">John Mahony</a>	<b>Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Chip Tofan</a>	<b>Vice Chair</b>
Councillor <a href="#">Rebecca Smith</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Eddie Rennie</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Sally Cresswell</a>	
Councillor <a href="#">Neil Hendy</a>	

This page is intentionally left blank